
Meeting	Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Date	12 March 2014
Subject	GP Services at Finchley Memorial Hospital
Report of	Scrutiny Office
Summary	This report provides the Committee with a submission from NHS England on GP Services at Finchley Memorial Hospital.

Officer Contributors	Andrew Charlwood, Overview and Scrutiny Manager
Status (public or exempt)	Public
Wards Affected	West Finchley, Woodhouse, North Finchley
Key Decision	N/A
Reason for urgency / exemption from call-in	N/A
Function of	Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Enclosures	Appendix A – Submission from NHS England
Contact for Further Information:	Andrew Charlwood, Overview and Scrutiny Manager, 020 8359 2014, andrew.charlwood@barnet.gov.uk

1. RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1.1 The Committee considers information from NHS England on GP Services at Finchley Memorial Hospital as set out in Appendix A.**

2. RELEVANT PREVIOUS DECISIONS

- 2.1 Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee, 12 December 2013, Agenda Item 5 – Members Item – GP Services at Finchley Memorial Hospital – the Committee considered a Members’ Item in the names of Councillor Geof Cooke in relation to NHS England seeking to relocate local GP practices onto the Finchley Memorial Hospital site. The Committee received representations from Councillor Jim Tierney, Ward Member for West Finchley, and the Practice Manager at the surgery of Dr Thwe at 209 Ballards Lane. Following consideration of the item, the Committee resolved that NHS England be requested to make a submission to the next meeting on the issues raised.

3. CORPORATE PRIORITIES AND POLICY CONSIDERATIONS

- 3.1 The Overview and Scrutiny Committees must ensure that the work of Scrutiny is reflective of the Council’s priorities.
- 3.2 The three priority outcomes set out in the 2013 – 2016 Corporate Plan are: –
- Promote responsible growth, development and success across the borough;
 - Support families and individuals that need it – promoting independence, learning and well-being; and
 - Improve the satisfaction of residents and businesses with the London Borough of Barnet as a place to live, work and study.
- 3.3 The work of the Barnet Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee supports the delivery of the following outcomes identified in the Corporate Plan:
- To sustain a strong partnership with the local NHS, so that families and individuals can maintain and improve their physical and mental health; and
 - To promote a healthy, active, independent and informed over 55 population in the borough to encourage and support our residents to age well.

4. RISK MANAGEMENT ISSUES

- 4.1 None in the context of this report.

5. EQUALITIES AND DIVERSITY ISSUES

- 5.1 Equality and diversity issues are a mandatory consideration in decision-making in the council pursuant to the Equality Act 2010. This means the council and all other organisations acting on its behalf must have due regard to the equality duties when exercising a public function. The broad purpose of

this duty is to integrate considerations of equality and good relations into day to day business requiring equality considerations to be reflected into the design of policies and the delivery of services and for these to be kept under review. Health partners as relevant public bodies must similarly discharge their duties under the Equality Act 2010 and consideration of equalities issues should therefore form part of their reports.

5.2 In addition to the Terms of Reference of the Committee, and in so far as relating to matters within its remit, the role of the Committee is to perform the Overview and Scrutiny role in relation to:

- The Council's leadership role in relation to diversity and inclusiveness; and
- The fulfilment of the Council's duties as employer including recruitment and retention, personnel, pensions and payroll services, staff development, equalities and health and safety.

6. USE OF RESOURCES IMPLICATIONS (Finance, Procurement, Performance & Value for Money, Staffing, IT, Property, Sustainability)

6.1 None in the context of this report.

7. LEGAL ISSUES

7.1 Section 244 of the National Health Service Act 2006 and Local Authority (Public Health, Health and Wellbeing Boards and Health Scrutiny) Regulations 2013/218; Part 4 Health Scrutiny by Local Authorities provides for the establishment of Health Overview and Scrutiny Committees by local authorities.

7.2 Health and Social Care Act 2012, Section 12 – introduces section 2B to the NHS Act 2006 which imposes a new target duty on the local authority to take such steps as it considers appropriate for improving the health of people in its area.

8. CONSTITUTIONAL POWERS (Relevant section from the Constitution, Key/Non-Key Decision)

8.1 Council Constitution, Overview and Scrutiny Procedure Rules – sets out the terms of reference of the Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee which includes:

- i) To perform the overview and scrutiny role in relation to health issues which impact upon the residents of the London Borough of Barnet and the functions services and activities of the National Health Service (NHS) and NHS bodies located within the London Borough of Barnet and in other areas.
- ii) To make reports and recommendations to the Executive, Health and Well-Being Board and/or other relevant authorities on health issues which affect or may affect the borough and its residents.

- iii) To receive, consider and respond to reports and consultations from the NHS Commissioning Board, Barnet Clinical Commissioning Group, Barnet Health and Well-Being Board and/or other health bodies.

9. BACKGROUND INFORMATION

- 9.1 As set out in paragraph 2.1, the Committee considered an item on GP Service at Finchley Memorial Hospital at their 12 December 2013 meeting. An extract from the minutes is set out below:
- 9.2 "Councillor Cooke informed the Committee that Dr Su Thwe (209 Ballards Lane, Finchley) was being forced by NHS England relocate her practice into the vacant GP spaces in Finchley Memorial Hospital as the current accommodation did not meet current NHS England accommodation standards.
- 9.3 At the invitation of the Chairman, Councillor Jim Tierney, Ward Member for West Finchley, addressed the Committee. Councillor Tierney considered that primary care services should be accessible within the community and questioned how moving an existing surgery from N3 to N12 would support this. The Committee were informed that Dr Thwe had 2,050 patients on her list and, when surveyed, 900 of these had indicated that they would not be prepared to travel to Finchley Memorial Hospital to access services.
- 9.4 Councillor Tierney advised the Committee that when Finchley Memorial Hospital was being redeveloped, there had been concern at the planning committee approval stage regarding the accessibility of the site and public transport links. He noted that at a previous meeting of the Committee, Transport for London had stated that they would not re-route local bus services into the hospital site as the cost would be prohibitive.
- 9.5 The Committee expressed disappointment that the Finchley Memorial Hospital Transport Plan submitted to the Council when the site was redeveloped had not been implemented and this was now causing on-going accessibility issues for patients.
- 9.6 A Member informed the Committee that NHS England were only able to require GP practices to move out of sub-standard premises when a GP retired.
- 9.7 Councillor Cooke noted that there was vacant space for GP premises on the Finchley Memorial Hospital site and there was a charge for the Barnet Clinical Commissioning Group for underutilised estates. Notwithstanding this, patients had indicated that they did not want the practice to move from its current high street location.
- 9.8 At the invitation of the Chairman, the Committee were addressed by Ms Soo Koh, Practice Manager at the surgery of Dr Thwe at 209 Ballards Lane, Finchley. She advised the Committee that the senior partner at Dr Thwe's practice had retired in March 2013 and that the surgery had been run on a caretaking basis since then. As such, NHS England had no obligation to retain the practice in its current location and could choose to advertise or disperse the list. The Committee noted that 209 Ballards Lane was currently

below the CQC minimum premises standards and as a consequence the premises needed to be refurbished or move to an alternative site. Dr Thwe's preferred option was to move the practice from 209 Ballards Lane to 100 Ballards Lane and work was on-going to bring this site up to standard. However, NHS England's preference was for the practice to move into the Finchley Memorial Hospital site.

RESOLVED that:-

- 1. the Committee invite NHS England to make a written submission and be invited to address the Committee at the March 2014 meeting on:
 - i) the issues detailed above regarding the decision to move Dr Thwe's practice to Finchley Memorial Hospital; and**
 - ii) any progress made in relocating GP practices into the vacant GP space at Finchley Memorial Hospital.****
- 2. the Committee receive a written submission in advance of the next meeting in relation to the impact of dispersing the patient list of two practices in the West Finchley area (Dr K Dodanwatawana, 110 – 112 Ballards Lane and Dr S S Thwe, 209 Ballards Lane)."**

9.9 The submission requested at 9.8 above has been received and is set out at **Appendix A**. Officers from NHS England will be in attendance to answer questions from the Committee.

10. LIST OF BACKGROUND PAPERS

10.1 None.

Cleared by Finance (Officer's initials)	JH
Cleared by Legal (Officer's initials)	SC